

MATH 195: Gödel, Escher, and Bach (Spring 2001)

Problem Set 12: Derivations

To be discussed Thursday, April 5

1. On p.260, Hofstadter gives HIS solution to the MU-puzzle, which (gratifyingly) is about the same as what we found a few weeks ago. In his solution, he appeals to “a simple fact from number theory”. Let’s treat this statement as a challenge to our budding abilities within TNT.

1a. Complete the outline of the proof of this simple fact, a fact that may be represented semi-symbolically as:

$$\text{" b: } \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } (2 \cdot \mathbf{b}) \rangle \hat{E} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$$

To make the proof short enough for our purposes, we’ve introduced an unofficial shorthand notation “(m divides n)” (represented in regular font rather than **bold** to remind you that it is not part of TNT. We’ll expand the short hand in problem 1b. Also, we’ve given you two theorems (lines 1 and 2), which you may consider as already proven.

(1)	" a: " b: $\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } (\mathbf{a} \cdot \mathbf{b}) \rangle \hat{E} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{a} \rangle \hat{U} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$	(given)
(2)	$\sim \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \rangle$	(given)
(3)	[Push
(4)	$\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \cdot \mathbf{b} \rangle$	premise
(5)	" a: " b: $\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } (\mathbf{a} \cdot \mathbf{b}) \rangle \hat{E} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{a} \rangle \hat{U} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$	Carry-over
(6)	" b: $\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } (2 \cdot \mathbf{b}) \rangle \hat{E} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \rangle \hat{U} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$	Specification, with _____
(7)	_____	Specification, with b=b
(8)	_____	Detachment, lines (2) and (___)
(9)	$\langle \sim \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \rangle \hat{E} \text{ _____} \rangle$	Switcheroo, line (___)
(10)	$\sim \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \rangle$	
(11)	$\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$	_____ Detachment
(12)]	Pop
(13)	_____	Fantasy rule
(14)	" b: $\langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } (2 \cdot \mathbf{b}) \rangle \hat{E} \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } \mathbf{b} \rangle$	_____

1b. Translate $\sim \langle \mathbf{3} \text{ divides } 2 \rangle$ completely into symbols in two ways:

$\sim \mathbf{\$a}$: _____

" a: _____

Preliminaries for problems 2 and 3.

The rules on p.263 refer to 8 different “NUMBER FORMS” (note that Forms 1a and 1b are found in Rule 1, etc.):

Form 1a: $10 \cdot m + 1$

Form 1b: $10 \cdot (10 \cdot m + 1)$

Form 2a: $3 \cdot 10^m + n$

Form 2b: $10^m \cdot (3 \cdot 10^m + n) + n$

Form 3a: $k \cdot 10^{m+3} + 111 \cdot 10^m + n$

Form 3b: $k \cdot 10^{m+1} + n$

Form 4a: $k \cdot 10^{m+2} + n$

Form 4b: $k \cdot 10^m + n$

2. Using the four rules in the forward direction.

2a. Show that 31 can be written in the NUMBER FORMS 1a and 2a by finding appropriate values for m and n.

2b. Using the values of m and n from your answer to 2a, what numbers are produced by NUMBER FORMS 1b and 2b?

- 2c. What numbers can be produced from the four rules using 31 as input?
- 2d. Does the answer to question 2c make sense in terms of the isomorphism at the level of symbols between the **MIU**-system and the **310**-system? Explain.
3. Using the four rules in the backwards direction.
- 3a. Show that 31 can be written in the NUMBER FORM 4b in two different ways by finding appropriate values for k , m , and n (use $n < 10^m$). HINT: 0 is a natural number.
- 3b. With the values of m and n from part a., what two numbers are produced by NUMBER FORM 4a?
- 3c. What input numbers can produce 31 as output?
- 3d. Does the answer to question 3c make sense in terms of the isomorphism at the level of symbols between the **MIU**-system and the **310**-system? Explain.
4. Using the numbering shown on p.261, translate the following strings into derivations within the **MIU** system (“,” means “new line”):
- 4a. 31,311,31111,311110
- 4b. 311111111,3011111,30110
5. Translate the following **MIU** strings into 310 numbering:
- 5a. **MIUIUIU**
- 5b. **UIMMM**
6. Which of the following numerical strings, when translated, are theorems within the **MIU** system?
- 6a. 30101
- 6b. 31111011011100111101
(If this last one throws you, then you need to read pp.260-261)
7. Complete the following derivations within the 310 system, using the rules (translated from **MIU**) shown on p.263.
- | | |
|-----------|--------------------------------|
| (1) 31 | Axiom |
| (2) _____ | Rule 2, $m=1$, $n=1$ |
| (3) _____ | Rule 2, $m=2$, $n=11$ |
| (4) _____ | Rule 1, $m=3111$ |
| (5) _____ | Rule 3, $m=1$, $n=0$, $k=31$ |
| (6) _____ | Rule 4, $m=0$, $n=0$, $k=31$ |
8. Translate the derivation below from the **MIU** system to the 310 system. Be sure to provide the number of the rule and the appropriate values or m , n , and k , as needed.
- | | |
|--------------------|-------|
| (1) MI | Axiom |
| (2) MII | |
| (3) MIII | |
| (4) MIIIIII | |
| (5) MIUIII | |
| (6) MIUI | |
| (7) MII | |